

SMA RULES September 2022 yellow = MPC edits gray = agency edits blue= staff edits

1	§12-202-15	Special management area use permit procedures
2	§12-202-16	Special management area emergency permit procedures
3	§12-202-17	Amendments to [and determinations of] permit [terms,
4		conditions, and time stipulations approvals.
5	[§12-202-18	(Reserved)
6	§12-202-19	(Reserved)
7	§12-202-20	(Reserved)]
8		
9		
10	Subchapter	Procedures to Adopt Special Management Area
11		Rules; Declaratory Rulings; [and] Adoption and
12		Amendment of Boundaries and Maps;
13		Enforcement; and Appeals
14		
15	§12-202-21	Petition and procedures to adopt, amend, or repeal
16		special management area rules; declaratory rulings
17	§12-202-22	Adoption and amendment of special management area
18		boundaries and maps
19	§12-202-23	Enforcement
20	§12-202-24	Conflicts with other laws
21	§12-202-25	Penalties
22	§12-202-26	Appeal of director's decision; filing the notice of appeal;
23		settlement of appeal
24	§12-202-27	Content of the [notice of] appeal
25	§12-202-28	Joint or consolidated appeals
26	§12-202-29	Service of the notice of appeal
27	§12-202-30	Payment of fees
28	§12-202-31	Contested case hearing on appeal
29	§12-202-32	Disposition of appeal
30		

SUBCHAPTER 1

2

1

GENERAL PROVISIONS

4 5 6

7

§12-202-1 <u>Title.</u> The rules in this chapter shall be known as the "Special Management Area Rules for the Maui Planning Commission."[.] [Eff 1/1/94] (Auth: HRS §§91-2, 205A-27) (Imp: HRS §205A-29)

8 9 10

1112

13

14 15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

§12-202-2 Purpose. The purpose of these rules is to implement Hawaii Revised Statutes (HRS) chapter 205A, relating to coastal zone management and special management areas, and to establish application procedures for special management area assessments, emergency permits, minor permits, and use permits, time periods within which hearings must be held, and procedures to provide notice to individuals whose property rights may be affected. The rules further the policy of the [state] State to preserve, protect and where possible, restore the natural resources of the The rules also assist the commission in giving full coastal zone. consideration to the [state] State policy of establishing special controls on development within the areas along the shoreline to avoid permanent loss of valuable coastal resources and foreclosure of land use and management options of these resources, and] to provide adequate access to beaches, recreational areas, and natural reserves. [Eff 1/1/94] (Auth: HRS §§91-2, 205A-27, 205A-29, 205A-30) (Imp: §§ HRS 205A-1 to 205A-33)

242526

2728

§12-202-3 Scope.[and exemptions.] (a) The rules contained in this chapter shall apply to the special management area on the island of Maui as designated on the special management area maps and specifically excluding the islands of Kahoolawe, Molokai, and Lanai.

33

34

35

36

37

38

(b) [The] At the discretion of the director, the rules in this chapter [shall] may not apply to special management area and shoreline [setback] area applications that have been deemed complete by the director before the effective date of these rules. An application shall be deemed complete by the director upon receipt of final agency comments and [a letter is] notification being sent by the [director] department to the applicant to that effect. Applications deemed complete [shall] may be processed under the rules in effect at the time the application was deemed complete. [Eff 1/1/94] (Auth: HRS §§46-4, 91-2, 205A-27, 205A-29) (Imp: HRS §205A-23)

39 23)

§12-202-4 Definitions. For the purposes of this chapter, and unless it is plainly evident from the context that a different meaning is intended, the definitions of this chapter shall be those set forth in sections 205A-1, 205A-22, and 205A-41, HRS ([a copy] copies of which shall be provided pursuant to section 12-202-7), and as follows:

"Best Management Practices" or "BMPs" means a set of mitigation actions that are intended to protect the environment from harm and to ensure that water quality and marine resources are protected during all phases of a project or activity (DPW).

"Categorical exemption" means a proposed use, activity, or operation for which a special management area assessment, emergency permit, minor permit, or use permit is not required, pursuant to section 12-202-11.5.

"Coastal dune" means one of possibly several continuous or nearly continuous mounds or ridges of unconsolidated sand continuous and immediately landward of the beach, situated so that it may be accessible to storm waves and seasonal high waves for release to the beach or offshore waters as defined by chapter 20.08, Maui County Code. (OP)

"Coastal erosion" means the wearing away of coastal lands, usually by wave attack, tidal or littoral currents, or wind. Coastal erosion is synonymous with shoreline (vegetation line) retreat.

"Commission" means the Maui planning commission.

["Crops" means agricultural produce or parts of plants or trees cultivated for commercial or personal use, including but not limited to the raising of livestock and aquaculture.

"Cultural resources commission" means the Maui County cultural resources commission established under chapters 2.40 and 2.88 of the Maui County Code.]

"Cumulative impact" or "cumulative effect" means the impact on the environment that results from the incremental impact of the proposed action when added to other past, present and reasonably foreseeable future actions regardless of what agency or person undertakes the other actions. Cumulative impacts can result from individually minor but collectively significant actions taking place over a period of time.

["Debris line" means a line marking the landward limit of debris deposits resulting from the upper reaches of the wash of waves.]

"Department" means the department of planning of the County of Maui.

"Development" means any of the uses, activities, or operations on land or in or under water within a special management area as defined by section 205A-22, HRS, as amended.

"Development plan" means a detailed drawing to scale that shows the proposed activity or structure and all areas where work will be performed. The plan shall include:

(1) Property boundaries;

- (2) All existing natural and constructed features and conditions that occur within the proposed area of work; and
- (3) All proposed modifications to existing features, such as excavation or other ground-altering activity (length, width, and depth), and proposed new features and conditions.
- The director may require that the plan include an accurate instrument survey of the lot as well as cross sections of the lot at designated locations to be prepared by a surveyor licensed in the State of Hawaii.

"Director" means the director of the department of planning of the County of Maui.

"Director of public works [and environmental management]" means the director of the department of public works [and environmental management] of the County of Maui.

<u>"Environmental assessment" or "environmental</u> impact statement" [or "EIS"] means an informational document that is <u>prepared</u> in compliance with chapter 343, HRS, and the rules of the office of environmental quality control.

"Erosion hazard line" means the mapped, 80 percent, cumulative probability contour of the coastal erosion hazard zone with 3.2 feet of sea level rise as approved by the director; such approval must reflect the best available science as published in peer reviewed literature such as the Hawaii Climate Change Mitigation and Adaptation Commission's 2017 Hawaii Sea Level Rise Vulnerability and Adaptation Report or its most current iteration, as accessible within the Hawaii Sea Level Rise Viewer hosted by the Pacific Islands Ocean Observing System, and as may be updated to reflect best available science.

["Estuarine sanctuary" means a research area which may include any part or all of an estuary, adjoining transitional areas, and adjacent uplands, constituting to the extent feasible a natural unit, set aside to provide scientists and students the opportunity to examine over a period of time the ecological relationships with the area.]

"Estuary" means that part of a river or stream or other body of water having unimpaired connection with the open sea, where the sea water is measurably diluted with fresh water derived from land drainage.

"Exempt action" or "exemption" means a proposed use, activity, or operation that is not a development as defined by section 205A-22, HRS and determined by the director, and as otherwise provided herein.

["Family" means a family as defined in title 19 of the Maui County Code, as amended.]

"Ground altering" or "ground disturbance" means grading, trenching, digging, grubbing, excavating or otherwise moving soil or other natural material that comprises the surface and subsurface of a parcel of land to the extent that such activity could potentially impact cultural or natural resources as determined by the director.

"HRS" means the Hawaii Revised Statutes, as amended.

"Hana advisory committee" means the Hana advisory committee to the Maui planning commission pursuant to chapter 2.28 of the Maui County Code.

"Lot" means a designated parcel, tract, or area of land established by subdivision or as otherwise established prior to the adoption of subdivision laws.

["NBCIDAC" means the Napili Bay civic improvement district advisory committee.

"Nonstructural improvements to existing commercial structures" means non-habitable improvements to existing structures, which improvements are adjunct to the main structure not to exceed fifty square feet in floor area; or temporary structures for special events not to exceed fourteen consecutive days. Improvements may include, but not be limited to, window or door replacement or addition, reroofing, storage additions, signage, tents, and booths.]

"Nonstructural improvement" is any improvement which does not involve load-bearing components essential to the stability of any part of the structure. Nonstructural improvements may include, but are not limited to, window or door replacement or additions, reroofing, storage sheds, fencing, signage, low impact development parking lot improvements, addition of solar panels that do not significantly alter building height or previously developed land area, or other activities that do not affect the integrity of a structure as defined in HRS 205A-22.

"Nonsubstantive amendment" means a proposed change to a permit scope that has no impact to the special management area or places additional demands on infrastructure that are discernibly different than that associated with the original approval. (OP)

"Owner" means all holders of an equitable or legal interest in real property on the island of Maui, including any lessee holding under a recorded lease with a term of five years or more.

["Plot plan" means a detailed map prepared to a scale, based upon an accurate instrument survey, defining and showing the design of the proposed action and the existing physical condition of the land, including but not limited to parcel boundaries, topography, natural and man made features, trees, and structures. The director may require the applicant to set forth in the plot plan cross sections of the site at designated locations.]

"Proposed action" means any use, activity, or operation proposed by an applicant [on land] within the special management area.

"Related adjacent parcel" means one or more lots or parcels that is next to, across the street from or in close proximity to, as determined by the director, a lot or parcel that is proposing or has proposed development as one combined or related project, including a project that is developed in phases.

"Reconstruction" means rebuilding more than 75 percent of an entire structure as measured by either the floor area or current valuation.

"Renovation" means the remodel, update, or upgrade of a structure that does not increase existing height or floor area and is not reconstruction.

"Repair" means the fixing or replacing of any part of an existing structure for the purpose of its maintenance, or renewal of surface treatments such as painting, carpeting, or exterior siding with substantially similar use of materials and location, but does not include expansion of use or intensity, reconstruction or renovation.

"Sand" means particles of mineralogic or rock material ranging in diameter from 0.0625 millimeters to 2 millimeters that shall be substantially clean of rubble and debris; shall contain no more than fifteen percent volume of silt which ranges in diameter from 0.039 millimeters to 0.0625 millimeters and clay which ranges in diameter from 0.00006 millimeters to .0039 millimeters; and shall not consist of artificially crushed coral as defined by chapter 20.08,

Maui County Code. Additional provisions on quality, such as for dune or beach restoration purposes, may be required.

 ["Scenic amenities" means significant coastal features including, but not limited to, areas of vegetation, growth, land forms such as dunes or rock outcroppings, mountain and seaward visual corridors, beaches, aquatic areas, and archeological and historic sites.

"Shoreline survey" means the actual field location of the shoreline prepared by a land surveyor registered in the State of Hawaii. Such survey maps developed by the registered land surveyor shall bear the surveyor's signature and date of field survey and the certifying signature and date of the chairman of the board of land and natural resources.

"Sea Level Rise Exposure Area" (SLR-XA) means the area mapped and otherwise used in peer-reviewed literature such as the Hawaii Climate Change Mitigation and Adaptation Commission's 2017 Hawaii Sea Level Rise Vulnerability and Adaptation Report or its most current iteration, as accessible within the Hawaii Sea Level Rise Viewer hosted by the Pacific Islands Ocean Observing System, and as may be updated to reflect best available science.

"Shoreline", as defined in HRS section 205A-1 as amended, means the upper reaches of the wash of the waves, other than storm and seismic waves, at high tide during the season of the year in which the highest wash of the waves occurs, usually evidenced by the edge of natural rather than artificially induced vegetation growth, or the upper limit of debris left by the wash of the waves [which] that has been certified by the board of land and natural resources for a duration determined by the board.

"Shoreline area" as defined in HRS section 205A-41, as amended, means all of the land area between the shoreline and the shoreline setback line, and may include the area between mean sea level and the shoreline, provided that if the highest annual wash of the waves is fixed or significantly affected by a structure that has not received all permits and approvals required by law or if any part of any structure in violation of this part extends seaward of the shoreline, then "shoreline area" shall include the entire structure.

"Significant effect" means the sum of effects on the quality of the environment, including actions that irrevocably commit a natural resource, curtail the range of beneficial uses of the environment, are contrary to the County's or State's environmental policies or long-term environmental goals as established by law, or adversely affect the economic welfare, social welfare or cultural practices of the community.

"Single-family residence" means [a] one single-family dwelling and [any accessory dwelling] all accessory structures thereto, including one accessory dwelling as defined in and provided by title 19 of the Maui County Code, as amended[.], including how floor area is calculated, that together may be considered an exempt action as defined in this section (OP). For the purposes of this definition, floor area means the roofed area of all floors of a structure measured from the exterior faces of the exterior walls or from the center line of party walls dividing a structure; the floor area of a structure, or portion of the floor area, that is not enclosed by exterior walls shall be the area under the covering, roof, or floor that is supported by posts, columns, partial walls, or similar structural members that define the wall line. Excluded from the floor area are:

- 1. Attic areas with head room less than seven feet.
- 2. Projections such as sunshade devices and architectural embellishments that are decorative only.
- 3. Areas covered by roofing treatment to screen rooftop machinery only.
- 4. Areas underneath unsupported roof overhangs or cantilevered building overhangs, provided no portion of the area is enclosed except for a safety railing or wall not exceeding four feet in height.

"Structural improvement" means any improvement that involves load-bearing components essential to the stability of the structure and that does not exceed \$500,000 in valuation.

"Structure" includes, as defined in HRS section 205A-41, as amended, any portion of any building, pavement, road, pipe, flume, utility line, fence, groin, wall, or revetment (DPW).

"Urban design review board" means the Maui County urban design review board as established under chapters 2.26 and 2.40 of the Maui County Code, as amended.

"Use" means a use as defined in title 19 of the Maui County Code, as amended.

["Vegetation growth" means any plant, tree, shrub, grass, or groups, clusters, or patches of the same naturally rooted and growing.

"Vegetation line" means a line marking the seaward limit of vegetation growth.] [Eff 1/1/94; am 9/28/97, am and comp

9/25/03, am and comp 4/21/08] (Auth: HRS §§91-2, 205A-29) (Imp: HRS §205A-29)

§12-202-5 Severability. If any provision of these rules or the application thereof to any person is held invalid, the invalidity shall not affect other provisions or applications of these rules [which] that can be given effect without the invalid provision or application. To that extent the provisions of these rules are severable. [Eff 1/1/94] (Auth: HRS §§91-2, 205A-29) (Imp: HRS §§91-2, 205A-9)

§12-202-6 Special management area boundaries and maps. The special management area shall be all lands so designated on the maps adopted by the commission as of November 19, 1975, or as amended pursuant to section 205A-23, HRS, which maps are in the keeping of the department. These maps shall be the official special management area to be administered and enforced under these rules. [Eff 1/1/94] (Auth: HRS §§91-2, 205A-23, 205A-27, 205A-29) (Imp: HRS §205A-23)

§12-202-7 Implementation of rules. The director shall provide such applications in a form as may be necessary to accomplish the intent of these rules, and shall provide upon request, a copy of sections of Hawaii Revised Statutes referenced in these rules. Such copies shall be provided as a convenience to the public and shall be accompanied with a disclosure cautioning readers that reproduced sections should not be relied upon to be accurate, complete, or applicable to any particular application and that reference should be made to the Hawaii Revised Statutes, all supplements thereto and [Acts] acts of the [state] State legislature. The director may also publish with the rules, or separately, tables, charts, or other graphics that will serve to clarify or illustrate various provisions. A charge may be imposed for copying costs. The director may adopt rules, and is authorized, to administer this chapter. [Eff 1/1/94, am and compl (Auth: HRS §§91-2, 205A-290) (Imp: HRS §205A-29)

[§12-202-8 (Reserved)] §12-202-9 (Reserved)]

SUBCHAPTER 2

SPECIAL MANAGEMENT AREA PERMIT PROCEDURES

- §12-202-10 <u>Special management area objectives and policies.</u> (a) The objectives and policies of this chapter shall be those set forth in section 205A-2, HRS, as amended.
- (b) In implementing these objectives and policies, the department or the commission, as appropriate, shall fully consider ecological, <u>environmental</u>, <u>recreational</u>, cultural, historic, and [aesthetic values] <u>scenic resources</u> as well as needs for economic development[.] <u>and hazard mitigation</u>. [Eff 1/1/94] (Auth: HRS §§91-2, 91-4.2, 205A-27, 205A-29) (Imp: HRS §§205A-2, 205A-4)

§12-202-11 Special management area review guidelines. The review guidelines set forth in section 205A-26, HRS, as amended, shall be used by the director and the commission, as appropriate, for the review of developments proposed in the special management area. [Eff 1/1/94] (Auth: HRS §§91-2, 91-4.2, 205A-29) (Imp: HRS §§205A-2, 205A-4, 205A-26)

§12-202-11.5 Special management area categorical exemptions. Pursuant to HRS 205A-22, it is hereby assessed and determined that any use, activity, or operation listed below, by its minimal nature, does not have a cumulative impact or a significant environmental or ecological effect on the special management area, and therefore is exempt from any requirements for a special management area permit. However, such uses, activities, or operations may be subject to other assessment or permitting requirements, such as a building permit, a historic district permit, or a flood development permit, and may require a shoreline setback approval if the action is located within the shoreline area.

Those who propose any use, activity or operation pursuant to subsections k, l and m below in the special management area must complete a declaration form, provided by the department and made accessible to the public, that may establish action-specific Best Management Practices and other appropriate restrictions.

(a) Transfer of land title; creation or termination of easements, covenants, or other rights in structure or land;

- (b) Normal and customary agricultural activities on land currently or historically used for such activities, provided that appropriate best management practices to control or minimize pesticide and sediment runoff are implemented to minimize impacts to nearshore waters;
- (c) Changes in uses or operations, including changes between short-term and long-term occupancy of dwelling units and various uses of beach parks that are under county or state jurisdiction, that do not increase the density or intensity of use as determined by the director. Increases in the density or intensity of use can be demonstrated by increased off-street parking requirements, pursuant to Title 19, Maui County Code, or increased storage needs;
- (d) Archaeological, geophysical, percolation, engineering, soils, and other scientific testing conducted by a licensed archaeological or scientific professional involving temporary excavation limited to the minimum extent determined necessary and appropriate or as approved by the State Historic Preservation Division, and employing best management practices protective of the environment and natural and cultural resources;
- e Nonstructural interior maintenance, repairs, and renovations to existing, lawfully established structures that involve no expansion or ground disturbance, and do not increase the density or intensity of use, such as paint, floors, carpets, cabinets, and interior walls and doors, limited to a cumulative valuation of less than \$500,000 in any 12-month period for a single ownership on a single lot or set of lots composing a unified building site. Increases in the density or intensity of use can be demonstrated by increased off-street parking requirements, pursuant to Title 19, Maui County Code, or increased storage needs;
- (f) Driveway and parking lot pavement patching, resurfacing, resealing, restriping, and repairs; and pavement reconstruction not over three hundred square feet (DPW/DOT);
- (g) Exterior installation on and maintenance, repairs, and renovations to existing, lawfully established structures that involve no ground disturbance and that are nonstructural, such as signage, wireless antennae and other transmission equipment, satellite dishes, and roof mounted equipment, such as photovoltaic and solar panels;

- (h) Site improvements, except in coastal dunes, involving limited ground disturbance, such as minor surface grading and grubbing, installation of turf, shallow landscaping, and irrigation, and installation of asphalt or concrete slabs and driveways, up to six inches deep, up to three hundred square feet, and no more than once in a 12-month period;
- limited ground disturbance more than six inches deep and up to sixteen square feet no more than once in a 12-month period for holes or trenching, such as the installation, removal, or maintenance of trees and shrubs, utility pedestals, ground signs, water, sewer, and conduit lines, walls and fences up to four feet in height, telephone and light poles, mailbox posts, and solar panels, provided that the improvements may be subject to shoreline setback approval pursuant to the Shoreline Rules, and provided that this does not include new wireless telecommunications towers, windmills and wind turbines;
- (j) Traditional native Hawaiian cultural practices that are conducted or led by native Hawaiian cultural practitioners and that do not have a detrimental environmental or ecological effect on the special management area.
- (k) Nonstructural exterior maintenance, repairs and renovations to existing, lawfully established structures that involve no ground disturbance, such as doors, windows, shutters, siding or roofs and, for structures erected in 1981 or after, to protect against impacts from lead-based paint, painting with related preparatory work; such activities are limited to a cumulative valuation of less than \$500,000 in any 24-month period for a single ownership on a single lot or set of lots composing a unified building site; and provided a declaration is filed with the department—for any maintenance, repairs or renovations performed at one time that have a total valuation of \$100,000 or more;
- Operation and maintenance activities for existing public roadways and drainage systems, subject to approval by the applicable state or county agency, such as vegetation management activities, including tree trimming and cutting and vegetation removal; clearing obstructions including beach sand accumulations that block publicly-owned drainage ways, provided that beach sand

- is placed on adjacent beaches or dunes, and the obstruction consists solely of beach sand that is removed to the minimum volume and depth necessary to allow for passage of flood waters; and including roadway pavement patching, repair, restriping and grooving but not including resealing, resurfacing or reconstruction (DPW/DOT); and provided a declaration is filed with the department;
- m With the application of best management practices to protect the marine and land environment, emergency protection of water, wastewater, or stormwater infrastructure managed by the Department of Water Supply, the Department of Environmental Management or the Department of Public Works if such infrastructure is at imminent risk of failure which would substantially affect public health or safety, including significant water loss, or contamination of surface water, land, or water supply, and provided a declaration is filed with the department; (DPW)
- (n) During the applicable timeframe of a Governor's or Mayor's disaster or emergency declaration or proclamation, while required permits are obtained and while using Best Management Practices:
 - (i) the removal and disposal of disaster debris that does not expand the area of disturbance; emergency structure stabilization and control erosion and runoff;
 - (ii) emergency repairs to roofs and windows that do not expand the footprint or use of the habitable structure while and after required permits are obtained;
 - (iii) emergency installation of protective measures to protect habitable structures provided such measures are temporary and limited in scale.

Failure to file a declaration could be subject to enforcement in accordance with these rules. Filing a declaration for an action that requires an assessment or a permit could be subject to enforcement in accordance with these rules. The department does not review or respond to the filing of declarations.

§12-202-11.6 Actions previously assessed and permitted. Any action in the special management area that was previously determined to be exempt, or that was determined to be a development and required and obtained a special management area permit, may be renovated or repaired in a manner that, as determined by the director, falls within the same scope of the prior

exemption or permit, provided that the action involves no groundaltering activity and does not expand the structure, unless otherwise provided by the terms of the exemption or permit.

§12-202-12 Assessment and determination procedures.

- (a) [All] Any proposed [actions] action within the special management area that does not fully fall within any of the categorical exemptions listed in section 12-202-11.5 shall be subject to an assessment and a determination made by the director as to whether it is a development and requires a special management area use permit or minor permit or is an exempt action. Such assessment shall be pursuant to sections 205A-22 and HRS 205A-26, HRS, and the significance criteria set forth in this section. (OP)
- (b) The applicant or the director may waive assessment and determination, and the applicant may apply for a special management area use permit pursuant to the provisions of sections 12-202-13 and 12-202-15.
- (c) Assessment applications shall be [filed in accordance with the following] submitted in a format prescribed by the department and shall include the following information and documentation:
 - [(1) Any applicant for a proposed action which has been assessed under the National Environmental Policy Act (42 U.S.C. §4321, et. seq.) or under chapter 343, HRS, and for which a findings of no significant impact (FONSI) has been filed or a required EIS has been accepted, may apply directly for a special management area use permit or special management area minor permit.
 - (2) Any applicant seeking an assessment shall submit an application form, provided by the department, to the central coordinating agency. The application shall require the following information and documentation:

(A)]

(1) Identification of the applicant [along with] and documentation of ownership or tenancy and, if the applicant is not the owner, authorization by the [owners] owner of the parcel on which the proposed action is to occur; if the subject parcel has more than one owner and does not have a managing association

1 2		authorized to submit the application, evidence of
3	[(B)]	notification to all owners shall also be provided;
4	(2)	Tax map key number and acreage or square footage of
5	(2)	the parcel on which the proposed action is to occur;
6	(3)	A location map;
7	(C)]	riocation map,
8	(4)	A [plot] <u>development</u> plan, drawn to scale, of the parcel
9	(=)	upon which the proposed action is to occur [, and
10		photographs or VHS format video tape identifying the
11		area where the proposed action is to occur; the
12		development plan shall show existing conditions
13		including human-caused and natural features such as
14		large trees, rock outcroppings, or other known sensitive
15		environmental areas such as special flood hazard area,
16		coastal dune, tsunami zone, erosion hazard line within
17		the parcel, 3.2-foot sea level rise exposure area,
18		wetland, streams, estuary or geologically hazardous
19		land, as applicable;
20	<u>(5)</u>	If the proposed action involves new structures, the
21		applicant shall provide dimensioned floor plans,
22		sections, and elevations;
23	<u>(6)</u>	Photographs identifying the area where the action is to
24		occur; video may also be provided;
25	[(D)	A shoreline survey if the land abuts the shoreline;
26	•	provided, if the proposed action will occur outside of the
27		shoreline [setback] area, the director may waive a
28		survey if:
29		(i) the shoreline is fixed by a manmade structure or
30		structures which have been approved by
31		appropriate government agencies and for which
32		engineering drawings exist to locate the interface
33		between the shoreline and the structure;
34		(ii) the shoreline is fixed by natural stabilized
35		geographic features such as cliffs and rock
36		formations; or
37		(iii) the parcel is not abutting the shoreline.
38	(E)]	

1	<u>(7)</u>	A wri	tten description of the proposed action, including
2		[but	not limited to] the use, length, width, height,
3		[dept	h,] building materials, [and statement of
4		objec	tives;] size of structures in square feet and, if
5		appli	cable, area, depth, or volume of grubbing, grading,
6			and any other ground-altering activity such as
7		utility	y installation;
8	[(F)]		
9	<u>(8)</u>	A wri	itten description of the anticipated impacts of the
10		propo	osed action on the special management area that
11			esses or describes:
12		[(i)]	
13		(A)	The environmental setting of the parcel that is the
14			subject of the proposed action;
15		[(ii)]	
16		(B)	The relationship of the proposed action to [land
17			use plans, policies, and control of the affected
18			areal the objectives and policies of chapter 205A,
19			HRS; zoning; and the general plan;
20		[(iii)]	
21		(C)	The probable impact, including cumulative
22			impacts, of the proposed action on the
23			[environment;] special management area; and
24	[(iv)	Any p	probable adverse environmental effects that can be
25	avoid	-	
26		(v)	Alternatives to the proposed action;
27		(vi)]	• •
28		<u>(D)</u>	[Mitigating measures] Measures proposed to
29			minimize [impact] potential impacts, including
30			best management practices.[; and
31		(vii)	Any irreversible or irretrievable commitment of
32	resou	irces.	, and the second
33		(G)	A plan of the proposed action designating in
34	dime	` '	the location of the proposed action on the parcel.
35			es are included, the plan shall also show a
36			ed floor plan, sections, elevations, and other
37			atures;
38	1 3	(H)]	•

(9)A written estimated valuation of all components of the 1 proposed action, including any component that could 2 be considered to be exempt; the director may require an 3 estimated valuation [as estimated] by an architect, 4 engineer, or contractor licensed by the department of 5 commerce and consumer affairs, State of Hawaii, or 6 7 written valuation of the proposed action as estimated 8 by] the administrator of the development services administration, department of public works, County of 9 Maui: 10 [(I) The state land use district boundary designation, 11 12 community plan designation, county zoning designation, and any other special designation, if applicable.] 13 A zoning and flood confirmation form, completed and (10)14 signed by the department unless the Department ceases 15 the use of such form: 16 17 [(J)][An] A draft environmental assessment [and findings of (11)18 no significant impact or anl or a draft environmental 19 impact statement, if the proposed action is subject to 20 chapter 343, HRS, and the department or commission 21 is the accepting agency; [if required, pursuant] or the 22 agency decision letter and any final environmental 23 24 document, if the proposed action is subject to chapter 343, HRS, and a government agency has determined 25 that the action is exempt, issued a finding of no 26 significant impact, or accepted a final environmental 27 impact statement; 28 29 [(K)](12)Any oral or written comments received by the applicant 30 31 governmental or [non-governmental] nongovernmental agencies, community organizations, 32 33 applicable design review committees, or individuals with regard to the proposed action, and a summary of 34 the dates and attendance of public meetings held on the 35 proposed action; 36 37 [(L)] Any other information and documentation required by 38 (13)the department to properly process the application; and 39

1 [(M)]An administrative fee as established in the [county] 2 (14)County budget. 3 4 (d) The assessment application shall be reviewed as 5 follows: Upon submission of [a completed] an application that 6 (1)7 contains all required information, the director may 8 submit the application to appropriate agencies for review and comment. The director shall request such 9 agencies to provide their comments on the application 10 within thirty days from the date on which the 11 application was distributed for review, or as otherwise 12 specified by the director. The director shall determine 13 that the application is complete when adequate agency 14 15 comments and, if applicable, applicant responses have been received. Upon a determination that an 16 application is complete, the director shall review the 17 proposed action and make a written evaluation as to: 18 The valuation of the proposed action. 19 director may request that the applicant's 20 estimates of the total cost or fair market value 21 [may] be verified by the director of public works 22 [and environmental management]. The director 23 24 of public works [and environmental management] shall use the most recent building valuation data 25 provided by the International Conference of 26 Building Officials. In the event of a conflict 27 between the estimates of the applicant and the 28 29 director of public works, [and environmental management, the higher estimate amount shall 30 be used by the director for the purposes of an 31 assessment of the proposed action; [and] 32 33 (B) Whether the proposed action is [or is not] a development or is an exempt action or, upon 34 further consideration, the proposed action did not 35 require a special management area assessment 36 and is a categorical exemption pursuant to 37 section 12-202-11.5; and

1		(C)	The potential adverse environmental and
2			ecological effects based upon the following
3			significance criteria [set forth in subsection (e).]:
4	[(e)	In	considering the significance of potential
5	- · · ·	ıtal ar	nd ecological effects, the director shall evaluate:
6	(1)]		
7	` /-	<u>(i)</u>	The sum of those effects that adversely affect the
8			quality of the environment and the ecology, and
9			[shall evaluate] the overall and cumulative
10			adverse effects of the proposed action, including
11			the extent of sea level rise impacts predicted
12			during the proposed action's lifespan (PD), [.];
13			[(2)]
14		<u>(ii)</u>	Every phase of a proposed action, its expected
15			primary and secondary consequences, and its
16			cumulative and [short] short-term or long-term
17			effects, including previous, ongoing and other
18			proposed or completed actions on the same parcel
19			or on related adjacent parcels that together with
20			<u>the subject parcel comprise a development,</u>
21			within the preceding three-two years (OP). A
22			proposed action may have a significant adverse
23			effect on the environment when the proposed
24			action <u>potentially</u> :
25			(A) Involves an irrevocable [commitment to loss or
26			destruction of or substantial and detrimental
27			effect on any natural or cultural resources;
28			(B) Significantly curtails the range of beneficial
29			uses of the environment;
30			(C) Conflicts with the [county's] County's or the
31			[state's] State's long-term environmental policies
32			or goals;
33			(D) Substantially and detrimentally affects the
34			economic or social welfare [and activities] of the
35			community, [county,] <u>County,</u> or [state] <u>State</u> ;
36			(E) Involves substantial [secondary impacts,
37			such as population changes and increased effects
38			on] and detrimental effects on public facilities,
39			[streets,] such as increased demand on drainage,
			202-20

1	sewage, and water systems, beach access,
2	recreational opportunities, and pedestrian
3	walkways;
4	(F) In itself has no [significant adverse]
5	substantial and detrimental effects but
6	cumulatively has [considerable effect] substantial
7	and detrimental effects upon the environment [or
8	involves a commitment for larger actions];
9	(G) Substantially and detrimentally affects a
10	rare, threatened, or endangered species of animal
11	or plant, or its habitat;
12	(H) Is inconsistent with the [state] State plan,
13	[county's] County general plan[,] including the
14	Maui Island Plan and appropriate community
15	plans, zoning, and subdivision ordinances;
16	(I) [Detrimentally] <u>Substantially and</u>
17	detrimentally affects air or water quality [or
18	ambient noise levels];
19	(J) [Affects] <u>Substantially and detrimentally</u>
20	affects or is likely to suffer damage by being
21	<u>located in</u> an environmentally sensitive area,
22	such as flood plain, shoreline, coastal dune,
23	tsunami zone, erosion-prone area, <u>sea level rise</u>
24	exposure area, wetland, geologically hazardous
25	land, estuary, fresh waters, or coastal waters;
26	(K) Substantially <u>and detrimentally</u> alters
27	natural land forms and existing public views, or
28	curtails or forecloses potential improvements to
29	<u>public views</u> , to and along the shoreline; or
30	(L) Is inconsistent with the objectives and
31	policies of chapter 205A, HRS.
32	(e) An application is automatically incomplete, at any stage
33	of the application process, if it is for or relates to land use on a lot
34	or on a unit in a condominium property regime that is the subject
35	of an unresolved enforcement action by the department, pursuant
36	to section 12-202-23, if the department has sent a notice of warning
37	or notice of violation for the enforcement action. However, an
38	application is not automatically incomplete if the applicant pays all
39	fines associated with the unresolved enforcement action as required

by the director, and approval of the application would resolve the enforcement action. An enforcement action is unresolved until all fines as determined by the director have been paid.

- [e](f) Based upon the assessment and review of the application, and considering the significance criteria set forth in section 202-12(d)(1)(C), (OP) the director shall make a determination and notify the applicant in writing within thirty calendar days after the application is complete that the proposed action either:
 - (1) Is exempt from the requirements of this chapter because it is not a development pursuant to section 205A-22, HRS, as amended;
 - (2) [Requires] <u>Is a development and requires</u> a special management area minor permit pursuant to section 205A-22, HRS, as amended, which shall be processed in accordance with section 12-202-14; or
 - (3) [Requires] <u>Is a development and requires</u> a special management area use permit pursuant to section 205A-22, HRS, as amended, which shall be processed in accordance with sections 12-202-13 and 12-202-15[;].
 - [(4) Requires a special management area emergency permit pursuant to section 205A-22, HRS, as amended, which shall be processed in accordance with section 12-202-16; or

(5)(g)

[f][Cannot be processed because]If the director determines that the proposed action is a development and requires a special management use or minor permit, and if the proposed action is not consistent with the [county] County general plan, including the Maui Island Plan and applicable community plan, [and] or zoning, [unless] the director shall notify the applicant that a general plan, community plan, or zoning [application for an appropriate] amendment is required and that an amendment application can be processed concurrently with the SMA permit application. [Eff 1/1/94; am 9/28/97; am and comp 9/25/03; am and comp 10/10/03; am and comp 12/20/04) (Auth: HRS §§91-2, 205A-27, 205A-29) (Imp: HRS §§205A-2, 205A-4, 205A-29, 205A-30.)

§12-202-13 Notice of application and notice of public hearing; adequacy of notice. (a) [Where a public hearing is

required to be held pursuant to these rules, the applicant shall prepare a notice of application and legible map. The form of the notice shall be provided to the applicant by the department.] Where these rules require a public hearing, the applicant shall prepare for the department's review a notice of application with a legible location map using a form provided by the department. Prior to publication, the department shall review the notice of application for completeness. [The] Within ten calendar days of departmental approval, the applicant shall submit the notice of application to a newspaper for publication to a newspaper within ten days of departmental approval]. The applicant shall publish the notice of application once in a newspaper printed and issued at least twice weekly in the County and which is generally circulated throughout the County.

- (b) [A public hearing before the commission shall commence within one hundred twenty calendar days, or as soon thereafter,] When required by these rules, the commission shall hold a public hearing after the director has determined the application is [complete.] ready for public hearing.
- (c) [Where a public hearing is required to be held pursuant to these rules, the] When these rules require a public hearing, the applicant shall prepare for the department's review a notice of public hearing with a legible location map using a form provided by the department. The department shall notify the applicant of the date of the public hearing at least forty-five days prior to the public hearing date. The department shall approve the applicant's notice of public hearing before mailing. [The applicant's mailed notice of public hearing shall be approved by the department before mailing and shall include:
 - (1) The applicant's name, mailing address, and the nature of the proposed development;
 - (2) The street address of the parcel that is the subject of the application (if available);
 - (3) The tax map key number(s) of the parcel;
 - (4) A location map;

- (5) The name of the applicant's agent and mailing address (if applicable);
 - (6) The date, time, and place of the public hearing; and

- (7) A statement that additional information may be obtained at the department's office, providing the department's address and telephone number.]
- (d) The [applicant's mailed] applicant shall mail the notice of public hearing [shall be mailed] not less than thirty calendar days before the hearing date by certified or registered mail or with delivery confirmation, postage prepaid, to owners of record of real property situated within five hundred feet of the boundaries of the parcel that is the subject of the application. The applicant shall obtain the addresses of the owners of record from the real property tax division, department of finance, within thirty calendar days prior to the mailing of the notice of public hearing. The applicant shall also send notice to all persons who have requested the commission in writing to be notified of the subject special management area proceedings.
- (e) Not less than thirty calendar days prior to the public hearing date, the director shall publish a notice of public hearing, once, in a newspaper that is printed and issued at least twice weekly in the County and which is generally circulated throughout the County, [and] pursuant to section 1-28.5, HRS. The notice shall state the nature of the proposed development, the date, time, and place of the hearing, and all other matters required by law.
- (f) The director may authorize the consolidation of the hearing with any other hearing required pursuant to law, or pursuant to any rules adopted thereunder.
- (g) The mailed notice of public hearing shall be deemed adequate, and the failure of any owner to receive such notice shall not invalidate any application, proceedings, assessment, or determination by the commission if the applicant, by affidavit, verifies that the names and addresses of owners of real property situated within five hundred feet of the subject parcel were obtained from the County of Maui real property tax [roll,] division, department of finance, [and that current ownership was verified with the records of the County's real property tax division,] within thirty days of the mailing of the notice of public hearing, stating both the date the addresses were obtained and the date notice was mailed, accompanied by receipts of certified or registered mail[.] or evidence of delivery confirmation. If there are multiple owners of [the] a property, notification of [the person(s)] all persons listed by name [on] in the records of the County of Maui real property tax [roll]

section 12-202-25.]

division, department of finance, shall be deemed adequate notice as to all owners. [Eff 1/1/94; am 9/28/97; am 11/13/00] (Auth: HRS §§91-2, 205A-27) (Imp: HRS §§1-28.5, 205A-29)

§12-202-14 Special management area minor permit procedures. (a) If [it] the director has [been] determined that the proposed action is a development and requires a special management area minor permit, the assessment application submitted pursuant to section 12-202-12 may be deemed the minor permit application. [I, provided that when development for which a minor permit is required is started before obtaining a permit, an additional fee of \$100 shall be paid by the applicant. The payment of said fee shall not relieve any persons from fully complying with

(b) The director shall approve, approve with conditions, or deny such permit in accordance with the guidelines in section 205A-26, HRS, as amended. The director may ask the commission to approve standard conditions that shall thereafter apply to all minor permits, in addition to any project-specific conditions, to ensure that permitted activities comply with chapter 205A, HRS. Any final decision shall be transmitted to the applicant in writing and shall be appealable pursuant to section 12-202-26.

the requirements of these rules nor from any penalties prescribed in

(c) The director shall notify the commission, at the commission's next regularly scheduled meeting, of [the issuance by the director] the director's approval of special management area minor permits, receipt of which shall be acknowledged by the commission. Such notification shall include [, but not be limited to,] the name of each applicant, the proposed development, [authorized by the permit,] and the location and purpose of the development. [Eff 1/1/94; am 9/28/97, am and comp 12/28/02] (Auth: HRS §§91-2, 91-4.2, 205A-27, 205A-29) (Imp: HRS §§205A-26, 205A-29, 205A-30)

§12-202-15 Special management area use permit procedures. (a) Any person whose proposed [development] action is a development and requires a special management area use permit, or who has waived an assessment by the department, shall file an application with the department on a form provided by the

department, which may be required to be filed electronically, and which shall require:

- (1) All information and documentation required pursuant to section 12-202-12c, [excluding valuation of the development;] and
- (2) [The real property tax map key number of parcels and the names and addresses of owners of real property for real property situated within five hundred feet of the boundaries of the parcel on which the proposed development is to occur, obtain from the County of Maui real property tax division;
- (3)] An administrative fee as established in the [county] County budget. [When development for which a fee is required is started before obtaining a permit, the fee shall be doubled.] The payment of the fee for development without a permit shall not relieve any persons from fully complying with the requirements of these rules nor from any penalties prescribed in section 12-202-25.
- [(4) Any other relevant information and documentation required by the director.]
- (b) Upon receipt of the application, the director shall review the application based on the policies, objectives, and guidelines as provided in sections 12-202-10 and 12-202-11 and, if necessary, request that the applicant provide any additional data or information as may be required for review of the proposed development. The application shall not be [deemed complete] <u>transmitted</u> for agency [transmittal] <u>review</u> until the director is satisfied that the application <u>has fulfilled all application requirements and</u> has addressed the policies, objectives, and guidelines.
- (c) The director shall submit the application, with all relevant information, to appropriate agencies for review and comment. The director shall request such agencies [, boards, and commissions] to review and comment on the proposed development within thirty days from the date on which the application was distributed for review. [, and shall request such agencies to address the maintenance, restoration, and enhancement of the special management area consistent with the objectives, policies and guidelines of chapter 205A, HRS, as amended.]

- (d) The director shall [inform the applicant of any legal requirement to] present the proposed development, if applicable, to the urban design review board [, the cultural resources commission and the NBCIDAC or the Hana advisory committee] for comment and recommendations to the commission. [The urban design review board and the cultural resources commission shall address the maintenance, restoration and enhancement of the special management area consistent with the objectives, policies, and guidelines of chapter 205A, HRS, as amended.] The [commission may designate the NBCIDAC or the] Hana advisory committee is hereby designated by the commission to conduct the public hearing for applications in the Hana Community Plan region.
- (e) [Upon receipt of final agency comments, the application shall be deemed complete by the director and shall be scheduled for public hearing.] Upon receipt of agency comments and, if applicable, adequate applicant responses, the director shall schedule the application for public hearing.
- (f) The commission shall approve a special management area use permit, subject to terms and conditions as permitted in sections 205A-26(1) and 205A-26(3), HRS, as amended, and any standard conditions approved by the commission if it finds the criteria set forth in sections 205A-26(2) and 205A-26(3), HRS, as amended, have been met. The commission shall deny a special management area use permit if it finds these criteria have not been met.
- (g) Findings of fact, conclusions of law, and decision and order shall be issued in accordance with the rules of practice and procedure for the commission in effect when action is taken.
- (h) The director may ask the commission to approve standard conditions that shall thereafter apply to all permits, in addition to any project-specific conditions, to ensure that permitted activities comply with chapter 205A, HRS. [Eff 1/1/94; am 9/28/97, am and comp 12/28/02, am and comp 4/21/08] (Auth: HRS §§91-2, 91-4.2, 205A-26, 205A-27, 205A-29) (Imp: HRS §§205A-4, 205A-26, 205A-28, 205A-29)

§12-202-16 Special management area emergency permit procedures.(a) An owner or authorized representative may apply for a special management area emergency permit when the owner or representative has concluded that danger or substantial harm to property, any person, or the public health, safety, and welfare is imminent. The director will consider the application, including best management practices to protect the environment, and determine whether the project is a development and therefore requires a permit, and whether conditions justify issuance of a permit to begin work immediately. The purpose of an emergency permit is to allow an urgently needed protective measure, principally of a temporary nature. The temporary measure may also be allowed as a permanent measure only after the director has determined it is the best environmentally sound alternative. A temporary measure may be allowed for no more than one hundred eighty days while, if necessary, a permanent measure is formulated, permitted, and completed. The director may approve a time extension for a temporary measure when the director determines the permit holder is making adequate progress toward completing a permanent measure, but cannot reasonably do so within the time the emergency permit, or an extension thereof, allows.

(b) Any person seeking a special management area emergency permit shall file an application with the director[.] before commencing any emergency work. The application, provided by the department, shall require:

- (1) Identification of the applicant [along with] and documentation of ownership or tenancy and, if the applicant is not the owner, authorization by the [owners] owner of the parcel on which the proposed action is to occur; if the parcel has more than one owner and does not have a managing association authorized to submit the application, evidence of notification to all owners shall be provided.
- (2) The tax map key [number(s)] <u>number and acreage or square footage</u> of the parcel on which the proposed action is to occur;
- (3) A written description of the proposed action, including [, but not limited to,] the length, width, height, [depth,] and type of materials, [for any proposed action] size of structures in square feet and, if applicable, area, depth, or volume of grubbing, grading, or fill and any other ground-altering activity;
- (4) A written statement of the emergency or imminent <u>danger</u>[and] <u>or</u> substantial harm to <u>property</u>, <u>any person</u>, <u>or</u> the public health, safety, or welfare; and why the proposed development would be immediately required to prevent <u>danger or</u> substantial [physical] harm [to persons or property, or to allow the reconstruction of structures damaged by natural hazards to their original form];
- (5) The most current shoreline survey, if available and applicable;
- (6) Photographs [or VHS format video tape] identifying [the emergency at the affected area and shoreline property boundaries] where the emergency exists and where the action is to occur; video may also be provided;

- (7) Any other relevant information requested by the director; [and]
- (8) <u>Electronic copies of all application documents; and</u>
- (9) An administrative fee as established in the County budget.

[(b)](c)The director may [waive] allow the deferral of the filing of a written application [where] if the applicant demonstrates to the satisfaction of the director that imminent danger [and] or substantial harm to a habitable structure, any person, or the public health, safety, or welfare would result from the delay in filing a written application. After giving verbal approval [of an oral] to such a request, the director shall issue a written [permit,] confirmation of the verbal approval, which shall contain:

- (1) The date and time the request was made;
- (2) The date the permit was issued;

- (3) Applicant's and project names, address, email address, and telephone number;
- (4) Tax map key number (if available);
- (5) Statement of the imminent danger posed and the substantial harm that [would] <u>could</u> occur [to the habitable structure] if the permit were not granted; [and]
- (6) The permitted temporary measures;
- (7) The requirement that not more than thirty calendar days after the approval of the request, the permit holder shall submit a written emergency permit application as provided in subsection (b), and that if the applicant fails to do so, the director may require that any temporary measure be removed; and
- [8] The statement that other permits may be required. [(c)] (d) [Not more than ten calendar days after the date of the oral request, the applicant shall submit the required written emergency permit application. If the applicant fails to submit such application, information, and documentation within the ten day period, the director may require that the temporary measures be removed.] No special management area emergency permit shall allow the repairs or reconstruction of structures if such structures were not lawfully constructed. (OP)
- [(d)] (e)[Except as provided in subsection (e),] After reviewing a written application, the director shall issue a written special management area emergency permit where the applicable provisions of this section have been met and[:
 - (1) The <u>Jthe</u> director finds the criteria set forth in sections 205A-22 and 205A-30, HRS, as amended, have been met. [;
 - (2)] In the event of impending or presently occurring disaster, the mayor [has waived] <u>may waive</u> the requirements of sections 12-202-12, 12-202-14, or 12-202-15, <u>but not this section.</u>[; or

- (3) In the event of a state-declared emergency, the governor, after conferral with and the recommendation of the mayor, has waived the requirements of sections 12-202-12, 12-202-14, or 12-202-15.
- (e) No special management area emergency permit shall allow the reconstruction of structures damaged by natural hazards to their original form if such structures were previously found not to be in compliance with the federal flood insurance program or were not legally constructed.]
- (f) The director may place reasonable terms, conditions, and time stipulations upon such permit.
- (g) The director shall set [an expiration] <u>a</u> date [for the permit, not to exceed one hundred eighty days, and set a time limitation within] <u>by</u> which the applicant shall [apply] <u>submit an application</u> for a permit pursuant to sections 12-202-14 or 12-202-15[.], or by which the applicant must remove or terminate any temporary measures.
- (h) For an emergency permit request that is the result of or that otherwise involves coastal erosion, the director shall consult with the State department of land and natural resources, office of conservation and coastal lands, or other relevant State agency, on whether to approve any temporary measure in order to benefit both the applicant and neighboring shoreline properties, to resolve the emergency situation expeditiously, and to minimize the environmental impact to the coastal zone. Any such approval, in addition to any project-specific conditions, shall include the following conditions:
 - (1) Within ninety days, the applicant shall provide the department a description of potential long-term alternatives designed to alleviate the emergency situation, which shall include:
 - (A) alternatives, including relocation of threatened structures or elevation of structures, and dune or beach restoration;
 - (B) assessment of other viable alternatives, which may include protective or erosion control measures, such as groins, and offshore structures such as breakwaters:
 - (C) a description of how each alternative complies with chapter 12-203 of the commission's shoreline rules, if applicable;
 - (C) a draft timeline to plan, design and complete each long-term alternative; and
 - (D) a list of potential federal, State, and County permits required to achieve each long-term alternative.
 - Within ninety days of the permit's approval, the permit holder shall consult with the department about identified long-term alternatives to understand the requirements and restrictions for work permitted in the shoreline area, as defined in the commission's shoreline rules, if applicable.
 - (3) The permit holder shall remove the temporary measure unless the permit holder submits an application by the date specified by the emergency permit to allow the temporary measure to remain, pursuant to subsection (i).

- (i) No less than thirty days prior to the expiration date of an emergency permit, the permit holder may apply for a time extension for any permit provision on a form provided by the department. Such application shall include, at a minimum:
 - (1) a description of the permit holder's preferred alternative;
 - evidence that the permit holder is making adequate progress toward completing permanent measures, but reasonably cannot do so within the time allowed by the emergency permit; and
 - (3) a plan and timeline for obtaining all required permits.

The director may approve a time extension for no more than one hundred eighty days at a time.

- (j) If the director finds there is no imminent danger or substantial harm to a habitable structure, any person, or the public health, safety, or welfare, or that the requirements of subsection (h) were not met, the director shall deny the emergency permit. If the director denies the emergency permit, the denial shall be in writing, setting forth facts sufficient to demonstrate the application did not meet the requirements for issuance of the emergency permit pursuant to subsection (h). The director shall notify the applicant it can submit an application for an assessment, a special management area use or minor permit in accordance with these rules, and shall inform the applicant of the right to appeal pursuant to section 12-202-26.
- [i](k) The director shall [submit reports] <u>provide notice</u> of the director's approval of all [determinations regarding] emergency permits to the commission [for review] at the next regular meeting after the permit has been issued, receipt of which shall be acknowledged by the commission. [Such reports shall include all facts and reasons for the determination.
- (i) If the director denies the emergency permit, the denial shall be in writing, setting forth facts sufficient to demonstrate the application did not meet the requirements for issuance of the emergency permit pursuant to subsection (d). The applicant shall be informed of his right to appeal pursuant to section 12-202-26 herein.] [Eff 1/1/94; am 9/28/97] (Auth: HRS §§91-2, 205A-27, 205A-29) (Imp: HRS §§91-2, 91-14, 205A-30)
- §12-202-17 <u>Amendments to [and determinations of] permit [terms, conditions, and time stipulations] approvals.</u> (a) <u>Request.</u> Any person who has been issued a special management area emergency permit, minor permit, or use permit may request the director or commission, as appropriate, to amend [, delete, or determine] any [conditions placed upon such] permit <u>approval</u>.
- (b) <u>Form.</u> Any person seeking to amend [, delete, or determine] a permit [condition]<u>approval</u> shall file an application with the department in a form provided by the department, the content of which shall include:
 - (1) [The term, condition, or time stipulation to be amended, deleted, or determined:
 - (2) If an extension of a time stipulation is requested, the length of time extension desired] A description of the requested amendment;

- [(3)](2) The reasons <u>and justification</u> for the [requested amendment, deletion, or determination] <u>request;</u>
- [(4)] (3) An administrative fee as established in the County budget; [and]
- [4] If the request is for a permit transfer, the transferor's consent and a notarized affidavit from the transferee acknowledging and agreeing to comply with the permit approval;
- (5) If the request is to amend a time stipulation, the length of time requested, an analysis of whether any changes have occurred within the special management area since the granting of the permit that may cause the permit holder's development to have a substantial adverse environmental or ecological effect or adversely affect the capacity or condition of infrastructure; and
- [(5)](6) Any other information and documentation requested by the director.
- **[**(c) Unless otherwise provided, any application for an extension of a time stipulation must be filed not less than sixty calendar days prior to the expiration date of the time condition, provided that the director for good cause may waive such sixty day requirement.

Unless waived by the applicant and the director, notice of the public hearing to amend or determine the permit shall be given pursuant to the procedures set forth in section 12-202-13. A public hearing shall not be waived if a petition to intervene was filed or any person, other than the applicant, was admitted as a party to any prior proceeding on the matter, unless a written waiver from all parties has been received by the department. In instances in which the proposed amendment or determination does not clearly pertain to or could not affect the same rights, privileges or interests on which the intervention was based, a written waiver from all parties shall not be required for purposes of waiving a public hearing.] If applicable, the director shall circulate the request to appropriate agencies for review and comment.

- [(d)](c) <u>Permit transfer.</u> Unless otherwise specified in <u>the</u> permit [conditions,] <u>approval</u>, the director may issue a written approval for a special management area use permit transfer.[, if the permit holder submits a written request for a permit transfer to include the following:
 - (1) Reason(s) for permit transfer;
 - (2) Transferor's consent; and
 - (3) Notarized affidavit from transferee acknowledging the conditions established with the subject permit and agreement by transferee to comply with these conditions.]

The director shall notify the commission, at the commission's next regularly scheduled meeting, of the issuance of any permit transfer, receipt of which shall be acknowledged by the commission. Such notification shall include [, but not be limited to,] the [aforementioned information provided to the department and] permit transfer approval letter. Nothing in this section shall prevent the director from forwarding any permit transfer request to the commission for [consideration] action in accordance with procedures set forth in this section.

[(e)](d) <u>Time stipulation</u>. Unless otherwise specified in <u>the</u> permit [conditions] <u>approval</u>, the director may approve a [special management area use permit] time extension <u>of no more than five years</u> to initiate construction or to complete construction, [if the permit holder submits a written request for a time extension. The request shall include the following:] <u>provided that</u>

[(1) Reason(s) for permit time extension;

- (2) Length of time extension requested;
- (3) An analysis of whether any changes have occurred within the special management area since the granting of the permit that may cause the permit holder's development to have a substantial adverse environmental or ecological effect; and
- (4) An analysis of whether any changes have occurred within the special management area since the granting of the permit that may cause the permit holder's development to adversely affect the capacity or condition of infrastructure.

If] the director determines that there have been no changes within the special management area since the granting of the permit that will cause the permit holder's development to have any substantial adverse environmental or ecological effect[, and that there have been no changes within the special management area since the granting of the permit that will cause the permit holder's development to]or adversely affect the condition or capacity of infrastructure.[, the director may grant up to a two-year time extension.]

If a petition to intervene was granted and any person other than the applicant was admitted as a party to any prior proceeding on the matter, the director shall notify such person at the person's last known address at least ten days prior to taking action on the time-extension request to determine if such person has any objections or concerns that the director should consider in deciding whether to approve or disapprove the request or forward the request to the commission.

The director shall notify the commission at the commission's next regularly scheduled meeting of the issuance of any time extension, receipt of which shall be acknowledged by the commission. Nothing in this section shall prevent the director from forwarding any time extension request to the commission for action in accordance with procedures set forth in this section.

[Prior to granting or denying any permit time extension request, the director shall notify the commission of the request at the commission's next regularly scheduled meeting, receipt of which shall be acknowledged by the commission. Such notification shall include, but not be limited to, the information provided to the department by the permit holder. The commission may review the permit time extension request at its next available meeting after receiving notice or waive review of the request. If the commission waives review of the request, the director may grant or deny the time extension and forward a copy of the determination to the commission.]

If the director finds there have been changes within the special management area since the granting of the permit that will cause the permit holder's development to have any substantial adverse environmental or

ecological effect, or adversely affect the condition or capacity of infrastructure, the request shall be scheduled for commission action.

A request for a time extension must be submitted prior to permit expiration. If a timely request is submitted but not approved prior to permit expiration, the permit shall remain in effect until the renewal is granted or denied, unless the applicant causes substantial delay in the review and approval process.

(e) Amendment or determination other than transfer or time extension. Unless otherwise specified in the permit approval, the director may approve nonsubstantive amendments to the permit and may make determinations regarding permit approvals when such amendments or determinations are nonsubstantive. If the director determines that the requested amendment or determination is substantive, then the director shall forward the request to the commission for action. The director shall determine whether a public hearing shall be held and, [(f) After review and final comment by appropriate agencies, the application shall be deemed complete by the director, and the application shall be referred to the commission and,] if a public hearing is required, set a date for the hearing and provide notice as required by section 12-202-13. The commission shall conduct a hearing in accordance with the procedures set forth in its rules.

(f) Intervention. If a petition to intervene was granted and any person other than the applicant was admitted as a party to any prior proceeding on the matter, and the proposed amendment or determination clearly pertains to or could affect the same rights, privileges or interests on which the intervention was based, the applicant shall notify such person in writing, at the person's last known address, of the requested amendment or determination, and ask if such person requests that a public hearing be held. The applicant shall provide the department with evidence of such notification, including proof of mailing, which shall be verified by the department and be to the satisfaction of the director. A public hearing on the requested amendment or determination shall be held if requested by any such person within thirty days of the date the applicant's notice was mailed. Notice of public hearing shall be given pursuant to the procedures set forth in section 12-202-13. The commission shall conduct a hearing in accordance with the procedures set forth in its rules. This section shall not apply to requests for permit transfers or time extensions. Requests for permit transfers shall be processed pursuant to section 12-202-17(c) and requests for time extensions shall be processed pursuant to section 12-202-17(d).

(g) <u>Commission action</u>. Findings of fact, conclusions of law, and decision and order for any special management area use permit application seeking to amend[, delete,] or determine <u>any</u> permit [terms, conditions, and time stipulations]<u>approval</u> shall be issued in accordance with the rules of practice and procedure of the commission in effect when action is taken and the review guidelines as set forth in section 12-202-11. [Eff 1/1/94; am 9/28/97, am and comp 4/21/08] (Auth: HRS §§91-2, 205A-29, 205A-30) (Imp: HRS §§205A-26, 205A-29)

SMA RULES March 2022 yellow = MPC edits gray = agency edits blue= staff edits

1	[§12-202-18	(Reserved)
2	§12-202-19	(Reserved)
3	§12-202-20	(Reserved)]
4		
5		

SUBCHAPTER 3

PROCEDURES TO ADOPT SPECIAL MANAGEMENT AREA RULES; DECLARATORY RULINGS; [AND] ADOPTION AND AMENDMENT OF BOUNDARIES AND MAPS; ENFORCEMENT; AND APPEALS

§12-202-21 Petition and procedures to adopt, amend, or repeal special management area rules; declaratory rulings. The commission may adopt, amend, or repeal any of [its]these rules by following the procedures outlined in its rules of practice and procedure section 12-201-92. Any interested person may petition the commission for a declaratory order as to applicability of any statutory provision or, of [any]these rules, or of any order of the department or the commission relating to the special management area pursuant to the commission's rules of practice and procedure section 12-201-93. [Eff 1/1/94] (Auth: HRS §91-2) (Imp: HRS §§91-3, 91-4, 91-6, 91-7)

- §12-202-22 Adoption and amendment of special management area boundaries and maps. (a) [Any amendment to the boundaries of any special management area map adopted and filed with the department as of November 19, 1975, or as amended pursuant to section 205A-23, HRS, as amended, and these rules, may be initiated by the director in accordance to the requirements of this section.] The director may, at any time, initiate a review of and amendments to the boundaries of any special management area map in accordance with the requirements of this section.
- (b) [The director may at any time initiate comprehensive review and amendments to the special management area boundaries.
- (c)] The commission, by a two-thirds vote of its total membership, may direct the director to initiate a [comprehensive] review of and amendments to the special management area boundaries.
- [(d)] (c) The director shall give notice of the director's intent to amend the special management area boundaries to the commission, the general public, and the office of planning, stating the initiation date and estimated completion date of the director's review and [shall submit] submittal of the proposed amendments to the commission. Upon submittal of the proposed amendments to the commission, the director shall schedule the proposed amendments for public hearing.

Not less than thirty calendar days before the public hearing date, the director shall publish a notice of public hearing once in a newspaper that is printed and issued at least twice weekly in the County and [which] is generally circulated throughout the County,[and] pursuant to section 1-28.5, HRS. The notice shall state the proposed amendment, the date, time, and place of the hearing, a map of the proposed boundary amendment, and all other matters required by law.

The notice published in the newspaper shall be deemed adequate, and the failure of any owner to receive such notice shall not invalidate any amendments, proceedings, assessment, or determination by the commission.

[(e)](d) The commission may amend the special management area boundaries only upon the finding that the amendments will further the objectives and policies of chapter 205A, HRS, as amended, and will be consistent with the general plan and other applicable ordinances of the County of Maui. Upon review of the State of Hawaii office of planning, pursuant to section 205A-23, HRS, the commission shall render a final decision and issue a written order and, if applicable, [may] direct the director to issue a [written order and] final map within sixty calendar days after the final vote of the commission, unless otherwise extended by vote of the [members of the] commission. [Eff 1/1/94; am 9/28/97; am 11/13/00] (Auth: HRS §91-2) (Imp: HRS §§1-28.5, 205A-23)

§12-202-23 Enforcement. (a) The [appropriate enforcement agency as designated by the County Charter] <u>director</u> shall enforce these rules, except as otherwise provided herein.

- (b) Any [development]use, activity, construction or operation pursuant to these rules and section 205A-22, HRS, as amended, that [has not received a required]requires and fails to obtain a special management area exemption, emergency permit, minor permit, or use permit [pursuant to this part] or has failed to comply[complied] with conditions established with any such [a] permit, is a violation of these rules and chapter 205A, HRS.[shall be removed or the violation shall be corrected by immediate application for and subsequent granting of the appropriate permit or other means as determined by the director.]The violation shall be corrected by requiring the owner or violator to pay all applicable fines and take the following corrective actions:
 - (1) Any unpermitted use, activity, or operation has ceased;
 - (2) Any unpermitted construction has been removed with appropriate permits;
 - (3) An exemption, emergency permit, minor permit, permit amendment, or use permit has been issued; or
- (4) Other means determined by the director have been achieved. Applicable fines shall accrue until the violation is corrected. No other [state or county] permit or approval shall be construed as special management area permit approval pursuant to this part.
- (c) [Where the shoreline is affected by a manmade] If a portion of a constructed structure is situated within the special management area, and the structure that] has not been authorized with government agency permits required by law, [if any part of the structure is on private property,] then for purposes of enforcement of this part, the [development] entire structure shall be construed to be entirely within the special management area and shall be [removed or the violation shall be corrected.] subject to enforcement accordingly.
 - (d) Issuance of notice of violation and order.
 - (1) The [landowner] owner shall, and [or] the alleged violator may, [or both, shall] be notified by the enforcement agency [by certified or

registered mail] of an alleged violation of [this rule,]these rules and 1 any approval, permit, or permit condition issued pursuant thereto. [, 2 or any condition of a special management area permit approval. The 3 director shall provide service by at least one of the following 4 methods, in order of preference, as the director deems appropriate: 5 certified or registered mail, regular mail with delivery confirmation, 6 personal service, posting on the property, or publishing the notice 7 once per week for three consecutive weeks in a newspaper that is 8 9 printed and issued at least twice weekly in the County and is generally circulated through the County. The date of service shall be 10 the date on which the certified or registered mail is accepted, the 11 date of regular mail delivery confirmation, the date of personal 12 service, the date of posting on the property, or the date of the last 13 14 publication in the newspaper. If the director uses more than one method of service, then the date of service shall be the later of the 15 dates of service. 16 17 **(2)** 18 19 20

- The notice of violation and order shall include [, but not be limited to,] the specific section of [this rule which] these rules that has been violated[,]; the nature of the violation[,]; and the [remedy(ies)] remedy required or available[.], including cessation or removal of the violation, subject to applicable permitting requirements: I. notice of violation and order may also require that the violative activity cease, or that the violative development be removed;] that [a] an initial civil fine be paid not to exceed \$100,000 per violation; [and] that a civil fine be paid not to exceed \$10,000 per day for each day in which the violation persists, unless otherwise required or allowed by statute, in addition to the foregoing and any other penalties[.]; and that the landowner or violator may appeal the notice of violation pursuant to section 12-202-26 within thirty days of the date of service. The filing of an appeal shall not correct or suspend any violation or stay the assessment and accumulation of fines. The following and other applicable and reasonable criteria shall be considered in assessing the initial and daily fines:
 - (A) Previous violations by the same person;

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33 34

35

36

37

38 39

40

41

42

43

44

45

- (B) The degree of damage or potential damage to the environment, including damage to the shoreline and marine resources;
- (C) The degree of cooperation provided by the violator during the investigation;
- (D) Amount necessary to deter future violations;
- (E) Evidence of circumstances beyond the control of the violator;
- (F) Whether the owner or violator knew or should have known that assessments or approvals were required; and
- (G) The amount of time and resources required by the department to investigate and determine that a violation occurred.
- The notice of violation and order shall state that the order shall become final thirty days after the date of its mailing unless written

- request for a hearing is mailed or delivered to the enforcement agency within said thirty days. Nothing in this section shall prevent the landowner or violator from seeking to negotiate a settlement or resolve a dispute.
- (3) If the violator seeks a negotiated settlement with the enforcement agency, but waives the right to a hearing, the enforcement agency, in consultation with the department and the corporation counsel, may negotiate a settlement agreement with the landowner or, if appropriate, the violator, that provides for cure of the violation, set any fine, and inspection of parcel by the enforcement agency and the department. The proposed settlement shall be forwarded to the commission for final action.
- (4) Any request for a hearing shall be in writing and delivered, or mailed and postmark dated, to the department within thirty days, as stated on the notice. Upon receipt of a request for a hearing, the department shall specify a time and place for the person subject to the order to appear and be heard. The hearing shall be conducted by the director or the director's designee in accordance with the provisions of chapter 91, HRS, as amended.]
- (5)](3)The department, in consultation with the department of the corporation counsel, may institute a civil action in any court of competent jurisdiction for the enforcement of any settlement agreement or order issued pursuant to this section.
- [(6)](4)Nothing in this section shall prohibit the department, through the corporation counsel, from filing an order or motion directly with a court in the event that public health, safety and welfare may be at risk.
- Nothing in this section shall prohibit the department from issuing a warning to the violator before issuing a notice of violation and order. [Eff 1/1/94; am 9/28/97] (Auth: HRS §205A-43, 205A-43.6) (Imp: HRS §43.6)

§12-202-24 <u>Conflicts with other laws.</u> In case of a conflict between the requirements of any other [state] <u>State</u> law or [county] <u>County</u> ordinance regarding the special management area, the more restrictive requirements shall apply in furthering the purposes of this part. Nothing contained in this part shall be construed to diminish the jurisdiction of the [state] <u>State</u> department of transportation over wharves, airports, docks, piers, or other commercial harbors, and any other maritime facilities constructed by the [state] <u>State</u>; provided that such plans are submitted for the review and information of the officer of the respective agency charged with the administration of the [county] <u>County</u> zoning laws, and found not to conflict with any [county] <u>County</u> ordinances, zoning laws, and building codes. [Eff 1/1/94; am 9/28/97] (Auth: HRS §205A-48) (Imp: HRS §205A-48)

202-39

§12-202-25 Penalties. Any person who violates any provision of these rules shall be liable for an initial civil fine not to exceed \$100,000 per violation and maximum daily fine of \$10,000 in addition to any other penalties until the violation is [corrected.]remedied, unless otherwise required or allowed by statute. A civil fine may be imposed by the department after an opportunity for [a] an appeal hearing under chapter 91, HRS, as amended, and subsection 12-202-26(b) herein.[unless said hearing is otherwise waived.] A special management area permit application submitted subsequent to an applicant's having completed the development or having been cited for the activity or construction without having obtained special management area approval, shall not stay any order to pay civil fines[.], including initial and accumulating daily fines. [Eff 1/1/94; am 9/28/97] (Auth: HRS §205A-32) (Imp: HRS §8205A-22, 205A-26, 205A-29, 205A-30, 205A-33)

§12-202-26 Appeal of director's decision; filing the notice of appeal; settlement of appeal. (a)For decisions other than enforcement proceedings pursuant to section 12-202-23, appeal of the director's decision may be made to the commission by the filing of a notice of appeal with the department not later than ten days after the receipt of the director's written decision, or, where the director's decision is not required by the commission or these rules to be served upon appellant, not later than ten days after the meeting at which the commission received notification of the director's decision. For enforcement proceedings pursuant to section 12-202-23, appeal of a notice of violation may be made to the commission by the filing of a notice of appeal with the department within thirty days of the date of service. The notice of appeal shall be filed in accordance with section 12-201-20 of the rules of practice and procedure for the Maui planning commission. The department shall notify the commission, at the commission's next regularly scheduled meeting, of the filing of the notice of appeal.

- (b) An owner or violator who receives a notice of violation and order who believes that any part of the notice of violation and order, including fines, was issued in error, may submit a written request for the director to negotiate a final resolution of issues, including any corrective action that must be taken by the owner or violator, any permits that are required, any fines that must be paid, and any actions that are required by the department. The request shall be submitted within ten days of the date of service of the notice and may be submitted in addition to or instead of an appeal pursuant to subsection (a).
- (c) The director and owner or violator may agree on a resolution that includes a reduction of accumulated fines and correction of the violation. If the resolution reduces the accumulated fines by \$50,000 or less, then the director will notify the owner or violator in writing and establish which party shall draft the agreement. At the commission's next regularly scheduled meeting, the director shall notify the commission of the agreement, receipt of which shall be acknowledged by the commission.
- (d) If the director and the owner or violator agree on a resolution that reduces the accumulated fines by more than \$50,000, then the director will

notify the owner or violator in writing and establish which party shall draft the agreement. The agreement shall be submitted to the commission for final action. The commission may accept, accept with modifications, or reject the agreement.

(e) If the director and the owner or violator do not agree on a resolution, the director will notify the owner or violator in writing of the director's termination of the negotiation. Submittal of any request for a negotiated resolution shall not affect the accrual of daily fines or any time limitations for appealing the notice of violation and order to the commission. [Eff 1/1/94; am and comp 9/28/97; am and comp 11/4/02] (Auth: Charter §§ 8-8.4, 13-2.15)(Imp: HRS §§205A-29, 205A-30, 205A-49)

§12-202-27 Content of the [notice of] appeal. The [notice of] appeal to the commission shall identify the party [or parties taking] making the appeal [in the caption and body of the notice of appeal]. The [notice of] appeal shall designate the decision appealed from and shall state the reasons for the appeal. [Eff 11/4/02; comp 11/4/02] (Auth: Charter §§8-8.4, 13-2.15)(Imp: HRS §§205A-29, 205A-30, 205A-49)

§12-202-28 <u>Joint or consolidated appeals</u>. If two or more parties are entitled to appeal [from] a decision of the director to the commission and their interests are such as to make joinder practicable, they may file a joint appeal and thereafter proceed on appeal as a single appellant. Appeals <u>that are filed separately</u> may be consolidated by order of the commission upon the commission's own motion, upon motion of a party, or upon stipulation of the parties to the several appeals. [Eff 11/4/02; comp 11/4/02] (Auth: Charter §§8-8.4, 13-2.15)(Imp: HRS §§205A-29, 205A-30, 205A-49)

§12-202-29 Service of the [notice of] appeal. If the appellant is someone other than the applicant, appellant shall serve a file-marked copy of the appeal by mail or delivery thereof to counsel of record for each other party, or, if a party is not represented by counsel, to the party at the party's last known address. Proof of service shall be filed with the department within seven days after the filing of the [notice of]appeal[.],and the department shall notify the commission of the filing of the appeal at the next regular meeting. [Eff 11/4/02; comp 11/4/02] (Auth: Charter §§8-8.4, 13-2.15)(Imp: HRS §§205A-29, 205A-30, 205A-49)

§12-202-30 Payment of fees. Upon the filing of any separate or joint [notice of] appeal, the appellant shall pay such fees as are set forth in the County budget ordinance. [Eff 11/4/02; comp 11/4/02] (Auth: Charter §§8-8.4, 13-2.15)(Imp: HRS §§205A-29, 205A-30, 205A-49)

§12-202-31 Contested case hearing on appeal. The commission shall hold a contested case hearing on the appeal. The director, the appellant, the owner, and, where the appellant is someone other than the applicant, the applicant shall be parties to the proceedings. Subchapters 3, 4, and 5 of the

rules of practice and procedure for the Maui planning commission, relating to petitions to intervene, contested case procedures, and [posthearing] post-hearing procedures, respectively, shall govern the proceedings, except that petitions to intervene on an appeal shall be filed with the commission no later than ten days after the meeting at which the commission received notification of the filing of an appeal. [Eff 11/4/02; comp 11/4/02] (Auth: Charter §§8-8.4, 13-2.15)(Imp: HRS §§205A-29, 205A-30, 205A-49)

- §12-202-32 <u>Disposition of appeal.</u> The commission may affirm the decision of the director, or may remand the case to the hearing officer, if any, with instructions for further proceedings; or it may [reverse] modify the decision of the director if the substantial rights of the appellant may have been prejudiced because the decision is:
 - (1) Based on clearly erroneous findings of material fact or erroneous application of the law; or
 - (2) Arbitrary or capricious in its application; or
 - (3) A clearly unwarranted abuse of discretion. [Eff 11/4/02; comp 11/4/02; am and comp 12/20/04] (Auth: HRS §§91-14(g)(6), 205A-43, 205A-43.5, 205A-43.6, 205A-45, 205A-49, Maui County Charter §§8-8.4, 13-2(15)) (Imp: HRS §§205A-29, 205A-30, 205A-43, 205A-43.5, 205A-43.6, 205A-45, 205A-49, Maui County Charter §§8-8.4, 13-2(15))